

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT

The Setting

The City of Cranston, Rhode Island, was incorporated in 1910. According to the 2000 Census, the City of Cranston had a population of 79,269, an addition of 3,209 residents from the 1990 Census. As the third most populated city in the State, Cranston is bordered by the City of Providence on the east, the City of Warwick and the Town of West Warwick on the south, and by the Town of Siate on the west. Cranston has a geographical area of 28.2 square miles. A City document dated February 2003 noted a population of 81,674.

Cranston's City Seal, which consists of three silver cranes on a red shield with a silver border, was taken from the coat of arms of Governor Samuel Cranston. The motto DUM VIGILO CURO has been translated as "While I watch I care."

The eastern portion of the City is more densely populated and tends to have more mature housing stock; the western portion still has lot of open land and is the location of new, upscale homes.

City Government

The City of Cranston has a Strong Mayor form of government. Prior to 2002, the Mayor served for a four-year term. In 2002, the term for the Mayor was changed to two years. The City Council consists of nine (9) partisan members who are elected for two-year terms. Six council members are from individual wards, and three council members are elected citywide. The Mayor is assisted in the day-to-day administration of City government by an appointed Business Administrator.

Police Department Staffing

There are 149 authorized sworn police positions in the Cranston Police Department. City Ordinance No. 2001-50 approved on October 23, 2001 amended Chapter 24, Section 1, of the City Code. Prior to this change, “The permanent members of the police department shall be as follows: one chief of police, who shall hold the rank of colonel, one major, six captains, (six lieutenants, eighteen (18) sergeants and one hundred seventeen (117) police officers). The amendment substituted the following: “seven (7) lieutenants, nineteen (19) sergeants, and one hundred fifteen (115) police officers.” This amendment established one additional lieutenant position and one sergeant position, and abolished two police officer positions.

The six captains are assigned as follows: one each in the Planning & Research Division, Internal Affairs Division, Training Division, Detective Division, and two in the Patrol Division.

According to police staff, the Cranston Police Department (CPD) lost approximately 17 percent of its authorized strength through attrition (primarily retirements) in 2002. A loss of 25 seasoned veterans in some police departments could be very difficult for a police department, especially if patrol officers are removed from patrol duties to fill vacant specialized positions. Police officials noted that a significant number of sworn members who left the Police Department in 2002 were from the Detective Division.

Police staff noted that during the Study Period, there were nine police officers in the State Police academy; and two officers were scheduled to begin the Academy in November 2003. In addition, 8 to 10 officers were out due to extended illness.

Officials stated that the Department has been operating at an estimated 70 percent of authorized sworn strength.

The civilian staff consists of 35 personnel: 15 Dispatch, 4 Animal Control, 11 Clerical, 3 Computer, one Bookkeeper, and one Switchboard.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

It should be noted that the City Code, Chapter 24, Section 24-1, subsection 'c' notes 27 civilian positions. A chart provided by the City as of March 20, 2003, reflected wages/fringes/total to that date for 29 civilian positions and one vacant position. In addition to the full-time civilian staff, there are also 18 part-time civilian personnel, and 38 crossing guards (26 full-time and 12 part-time).

Police Personnel Profile

Approximately 93 percent of the sworn workforce is male (i.e., 139 of 149). This percent is considered high when compared against nationwide police workforce statistics. Females then, are under-represented in the sworn workforce.

The non-white sworn representation on the Department is less than 3 percent (i.e., 4 of 149). This is a remarkably low percent when compared against nationwide police workforce statistics, and is also below the City's estimated racial/ethnic minority population of approximately 11 percent (5 percent Hispanic, 3 percent Asian, and 3 percent Black). It is important to note that the City's non-white population is increasing. Between 1990 and 2000, an increase of 6 percent occurred in the City's non-white population (i.e., 5 to 11 percent).

Among supervisory and managerial personnel, there is one non-white among a total of 32 such positions (i.e., Hispanic female). Among supervisory personnel, 20 percent are female (i.e., 2 of 10). This figure is high in comparison to their representation in the total sworn workforce (i.e., 7 percent).

Comparative Police Staffing

Although the Study Team does not utilize staffing ratios in public safety as a basis for determining a suggested staffing model, the data may be of interest to City officials and/or

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

stakeholders. The FBI publishes police staffing annually by municipality each year and the population of cities. The ratios are determined by dividing the staffing by the population in 1,000 increments.

Within the State of Rhode Island, there are five cities with a population of 40,000 to 100,000: Cranston, East Providence, Pawtucket, Warwick, and Woonsocket. Based on the 2001 FBI data in Crime in the United States, **Cranston had the lowest sworn staffing ratio at 1.86 sworn per 1,000 residents of the five cities. Cranston also had the lowest ratio of ‘Total Employees’ per 1,000 residents.**

At the national level, the International City/County Management Association (ICMA) publishes average data for municipalities in specific population ranges. In its 2003 Municipal Year Book, the average sworn for 167 cities with a population range of 50,000 to 100,000 was 1.75 sworn per 1,000 residents, compared to 1.86 for Cranston (2001 FBI data); for ‘Total Employees,’ the average for 172 cities was 2.46 per 1,000 residents, while Cranston was 2.24.

Based on these data, the Cranston Police Department’s staffing ratio for “Total” employees is below the average for 172 cities in a similar population range. If Cranston equaled the average of 2.46 “Total” employees per 1,000 residents, the Department would need 199 employees. (With a population of 81,674 in 2003, the sworn ratio is 1.82 per 1,000 residents.)

Police Department Mission Statement

Reportedly, there is no “Mission Statement” for the Cranston Police Department. Over the next five years, the Cranston Police Department will spend more than \$100 million. The reasons why there is no mission statement are unclear. The recommendation:

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

- A. Establish a Mission Statement, establish Service Level Objectives to meet the Mission Statement, and incorporate Values within a policy manual.

Police Organizational Chart

The Study Team was told that there is no formal organizational chart that depicts the current Cranston Police Department organizational structure. This is very atypical in local law enforcement. One staff member provided an organizational chart that was believed to be from 1998; however, the reporting procedures in 2003 are different than that structure.

The most recent directive relative to reorganization of the Cranston Police Department was promulgated on March 26, 2003. This directive was signed by the current Chief of Police and related to the Staff and Services Division. This directive noted that “the Director of Staff and Services will report to the Commander of the Planning and Research Division.”

The recommendation:

- B. Establish a Formal Police Department Organizational Chart, post the chart in the Police Department, and include the Chart in a new police policy manual.

Police Budgets

Based on the City’s budget documents, the Police Department’s adopted budgets increased from \$15,637,713 in 1998 to \$18,916,339 in 2002, an increase of \$3,278,626 or 21 percent. The 2003 budget, ending June 2003, reflected an ‘Actual’ budget of \$21,112,888. This included \$218,135 in Animal Control. The FY 2004 ‘Approved Council Budget’ provided to the Study Team reflects \$25,179, 814; this includes \$246,783 for Animal Control.

The State of Rhode Island publishes municipal budgets for police and fire departments by city. These data are identical to the FY2002 and FY2003 budget data published by the City of Cranston.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

Police Overtime

Police overtime increased from \$211,748 in 1998 to \$376,668, a 77.8 percent increase. A review of overtime by employee indicated that seven (7) sworn members earned more than \$10,000 in overtime in 2002. One employee earned \$17,746 in overtime. The same employee earned \$18,581 in 2001. Fifty-eight members who earned overtime in 2001 earned less than \$2,000 in overtime in 2002. The average amount of overtime per sworn member in the Cranston Police Department is less than the overtime costs in most police agencies evaluated by the Study Team in the past five years.

Police Grants

The Department has received various grants since 1998. According to records, the Department received in 1998 a \$300,000 grant that added four sworn personnel, increasing the total sworn from 145 to 149. Between 1998 and 2002, \$211,255 was received in Byrne Grants. These funds were utilized for equipment and training of supervisors, updating computers, changing records system and purchase of new computers and printers.

During interviews, police officials noted that they received two grants related to radio communications. Both are from Homeland Security through the Rhode Island Emergency Management Agency. One is for \$68,000 for an automated emergency telephone system to call people in the event of an emergency. The second is for \$390,000 to upgrade to the current UHF radio system to provide improved interoperability.

Comparative Police Costs

On a national level, the International City/County Management Association (ICMA) publishes annual data on police and fire costs. The Municipal Year Book, 2003, lists the average per capita costs in 2002 for police services as follows:

66 cities of all sizes in New England:	\$163.33
144 cities with a population range of 50,000 to 100,000:	\$188.70
72 cities with a population range of 100,000 to 250,000:	\$189.49

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

15 cities with a population range of 250,000 to 500,000:	\$208.16
7 cities with a population range of 500,000 to 1 million:	\$215.45

Based on Cranston & Rhode Island Web site Data:

Cranston Police Department: (\$18,916,339 ÷ 80,072) FY2002 **\$236.24**

It is important to note that the ICMA data includes tables on social security costs, retirement costs, hospitalization/medical costs, capital outlay, personnel costs, and 'other' costs.

Caution is required in the interpretation of the data; moreover, public safety personnel in Cranston note that practices in Rhode Island are different than cities in other states. The data are not to suggest that employees in any agency are overpaid, underpaid, or less equipped.

Index Crime (Serious Crime)

Cities with populations of 10,000 or more report specific crime information through the states to the Federal Bureau of Investigation as part of the Uniform Crime Reporting (UCR) system. These crimes are murder, rape, robbery, aggravated assault, burglary, larceny, auto theft, and arson. The first four are classified as Violent Crime; the latter four are classified as Property Crime. Arson is not reported by some agencies.

The data indicate good news for Cranston. In the City of Cranston, there were fewer Index Crimes in 2001 (2,511) and 2002 (2,632) than in the years 1993 (2,733) and 1995 (2,890). The trend is similar to serious crime patterns in some other cities evaluated by the Study Team. The 2,632 Index Crimes in 2002 included 147 violent crimes and 2,485 property crimes. The lower number of crimes in 2002 is also significant in light of the high attrition of sworn personnel in 2002.

In addition to Index Crimes, another classification of offenses are called Part II Crimes. These crimes relate to quality of life: 1) Simple Assaults; 2) Forgery & Counterfeiting; 3) Fraud; 4) Embezzlement; 5) Stolen Property; 6) Vandalism; 7) Weapons; 8) Prostitution & Commercialized Vice; 9) Sex Offenses; 10) Drug Abuse Violations; 11) Gambling; 12) Offenses against Family and Children; 13) Driving Under the Influence; 14) Liquor Laws; 15) Drunkenness; 16) Disorderly

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

Conduct; 17) Vagrancy; 18) Other Conditions or Violations. In total, there were 6,611 Part II offenses in 2002 in the City of Cranston. These data are not generally published by state or national agencies for comparative purposes.

Crime Rate

The crime rate in a municipality is determined by dividing the total number of Index Crimes by the population in 1,000 residents. The crime rate is viewed by criminal justice experts as an indicator of safety in a municipality.

The Study Team calculated the Crime Rate based on FBI UCR data for the five cities in Rhode Island within a population range of 40,000 to 100,000. Cranston's 2001 Crime Rate was 31.6 Index Crimes per 1,000 residents. Three cities reported a higher crime rate than Cranston: Pawtucket (40.63), Warwick (35.198), and Woonsocket (33.94). East Providence reported a lower crime rate at 26.05 crimes per 1,000 residents.

For the entire region (Connecticut, Massachusetts, and Rhode Island), the Study Team calculated the crime rates for cities in 2001 with populations from 50,000 to 100,000. Cranston is in the middle: 14 cities had a higher crime rate, 12 cities had a lower crime rate. Again, caution is required in the interpretation of data.

Efficiency (Clearance Rates)

One of the key indicators of police efficiency in statistical terms is clearance rates for Index Crime. In fact, the clearance rate (also called solution rate) for serious crime is the only national indicator of police efficiency. In Cranston, clearance rate data was not available; moreover, key management personnel didn't know the clearance rate. Nationally, the clearance rate for Index Crimes in 342 cities with a population of 50,000 to 100,000 in 2001 was 20.4 percent. For all cities, the clearance rate was 19.6 percent. For the future, the Clearance Rate should be utilized as a Performance Indicator, incorporated into the Budget process, and published for City officials and stakeholders.

Calls for Service

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

Police departments typically collect calls for service data. The data are utilized to determine workload on patrol officers, patrol beat boundaries, and supervisory requirements. The data are also important in analyses of response times to specific locations by patrol officers and to determine staffing requirements.

The precise definition of a call for service in Cranston is not expressed in writing.

The Study Team reviewed data provided by the Department and data utilized in reports for the City of Cranston by an outside firm. The number of “AS400-Incident Numbers” calls for service in 1996 was 47,507; the number reported in 2002 was 44,955, a reduction of 2,552 calls. In assessing categories of workload, the Cranston Police Department responded to 7,366 False Burglar Alarms in 2002, an average of 20 per day. The recommendations:

- A. Assure that citizen-initiated activity is reported separately from officer-initiated activity;
- B. Explore ways to reduce the high number of False Burglar Alarms; and,
- C. Utilize the calls for service data as part of assessing patrol beat boundaries on an annual basis.

Arrests

For the five-year period 1998-2002, there were fewer adult arrests in 2002 than 1998: 1,972 in 1998 and 1,896 in 2002. The number of juvenile arrests has varied by year. For example, there was a decrease in the number of juvenile arrests in 1997, increases in 2000 and 2001, and a decrease in 2002.

These arrest data are important when coupled with the reduced number of Index Crimes and the reduced number of calls for service (based on Department data) in 2002.

Patrol Operations

The patrol function in the Cranston Police Department is staffed with two captains (one works an evening shift), four lieutenants, 12 sergeants, and 63 officers assigned to three shifts. According to officials, there are an additional four to five officers assigned to work

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

from 6:45 p.m. to 2:45 a.m. These officers are assigned to what is referred to as the 'Sector Shift.'

Reportedly, the number of patrol beats in Cranston has been the same for approximately 15 years: 12 beats for the day shift, 12 beats for the second shift, and six beats for the third shift. There is no indication that the number of beats is based on workload or safety issues.

Staff members of the Department reported that the current management information system is not adequate to identify types and locations of calls by patrol beat. There is a high level of optimism that the Department's new computer system will provide the capabilities to track workload to improve operational efficiency.

Minimum patrol staffing was described as follows: eight (8) officers on the day shift (1st Shift); eight (8) officers on the afternoon shift (2nd Shift); six (6) officers on the midnight shift (3rd shift), and one (1) officer on the Sector Shift - 6:45 p.m. to 2:45 a.m.

The hours of work and shifts are noted in the labor agreement. Patrol personnel work a 4/2 shift, four days of work and two days off. Staff reported that this schedule has existed for more than 15 years. This work schedule results in officers having to work fewer hours in a year than officers working a 5/2 schedule.

To staff the existing patrol beat configuration, the Study Team estimated the need for 66 patrol officers. Based on data provided, the Department has 67 officers assigned to patrol. However, with 9 to 10 police officers in the police academy during the Study Period and two officers scheduled to begin training in November, actual patrol staffing is substantially below the number needed to staff these beats. If all sworn officers are trained and working, the City of Cranston seems to have an adequate number of patrol officers to staff the current beat configuration. As a cautionary note, the staffing formula is based on the existing patrol beat structure. **The Study Team believes the staffing on the midnight shift is light for a city with 80,000 residents; moreover, staff reported that the patrol beats have not changed in years.**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

The Cranston Police Department has two (2) officers assigned to schools. The reporting procedures change during the year. For example, during the time that school is in session, the officers report to the patrol captain (day captain). When school is not in session, typically the summer months, the officers report to a sergeant in the Family Violence Unit, which is within the Detective Division.

The Department has a SWAT unit; the duties are performed as a collateral function. Reportedly, personnel are to train twice a month. Staff noted that there has only been one or two call-outs per year. There is some question as to whether the procedures on hours for SWAT training are in compliance with FLSA. The recommendations include:

- A. Conduct a patrol beat analysis each year, to include number of calls by beat, types of calls by beat, back-up calls by beat, and 'queuing' time for calls by beat (delays in dispatch);
- B. Conduct response time analysis once the automation system is fully completed, especially times to emergencies in progress;
- C. Identify specific performance measurements for patrol staffing;
- D. Assign School Resource Officers to patrol services when schools are not in session, or on 'snow days;'
- E. Develop & promulgate an up-to-date policy on the utilization of 'light-duty' officers for telephone reporting at this time, and consider a long-term plan for this service, which has been proven to reduce workload on patrol officers in patrol beats;
- F. Assure the need for two days of SWAT training each month (consider in light of current contract);
- G. Assure that the traffic officers are utilized to assist patrol officers in beat patrols during peak workload periods;
- H. Request an assessment of whether training schedules for SWAT are acceptable under the FLSA; and,
- I. Consider "dual encumbering" Eight (8) additional Police Officer positions once the Department has the records/dispatch systems functioning adequately to provide the necessary data for a patrol beat analysis.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

Detention

The Cranston Police Department lock-up is intended as a short-term holding facility to maintain custody of detainees. Detainees to be held longer are transferred to a jail facility. The cell block consists of six cells. Four of the cells are for adult male prisoners and the two other cells are for use by female prisoners or juveniles. The latter two cells are separated from the adult male cells.

There is no permanent staff assigned to the lock-up. Members reported that there is also no clear organizational structure delineating who has responsibility for the lock-up. The Study Team asked several officials who was responsible for the lock-up, but no one seemed prepared to answer the question.

The lock-up facility is in poor condition, based primarily on the conditions of the Police Headquarters Building. Police staff could not point out the safety features in the lock-up, such as fire, heat, and smoke alarms. Adequate fire prevention practices and procedures were not posted and officials were not aware if periodic tests were conducted.

While the Study Team was conducting an onsite visit, officials related that one of the cells could not be used because the lock was inoperative and the cell had been chained closed. Later, officials said that the locksmith had told them the door lock was fine, but that the key was so worn that it would not longer operate the lock. There had supposedly been only two keys for the cells, so now there was only one key to open the cells. This should be considered a very serious situation, since the loss of the one key would make it very difficult to release prisoners from the cells. This is especially critical in the event of an emergency, such as a fire, and loss of life could result.

When asked about a policies and procedures manual for the lock-up, officials could not produce one and it does not seem that a current, comprehensive manual exists. This situation presents the potential for major liability exposure for the City of Cranston.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

Officials stated that people who need to be fingerprinted for job applications, immigration, etc. have to walk through the cell block. Prisoners have been known to spit and curse at women and men walking through. This practice also deprives the prisoners of their privacy. Reportedly, these physical conditions have been reported in the past years to City officials. The recommendations include:

- A. Establish clear organizational responsibility for the operation of the lock-up;
- B. Assure that updated, comprehensive policies and procedures are enacted to cover all aspects of the lock-up function;
- C. Enact policies to ensure the safety and security of staff and prisoners;
- D. Post appropriate safety and security directives, such as evacuation plans;
- E. Review the monitoring system in the lock-up to ensure it provides the visual and audio capabilities necessary for prisoner and officer safety.
- F. Establish procedures to ensure that staff observe every prisoner on a periodic basis;
- G. Establish a key control policy and have sufficient keys for safety purposes;
- H. Review the sanitation standards in the lock-up and support adequate janitorial service; and,
- I. Meet CALEA standards for lock-ups;

Fleet

The Study Team was provided with four lists of Police Department vehicles: Unmarked, Training Division, Marked Vehicles, and Special Investigations. The Department lists 14 vehicles assigned to the Special Investigations Unit.

Twenty-one of the 49 vehicles identified on a “Marked Vehicle Information” list have mileage in excess of 70,000 miles; eleven of these vehicles are listed as ‘spares.’ Typically, the Study Team suggests that police vehicles used in any operation that involves ‘Hot Pursuit,’ or requires the vehicles to exceed the speed limit, be replaced between 70,000-75,000. The number of spares seems high.

The City charges members \$15 for use of police cars on details. The fleet is handled by the City Garage.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

On balance, the Department seems to have more vehicles than necessary. However, the high mileage on some vehicles seems to require a higher number of spares than otherwise may be needed. The mileage on the marked spare vehicles is, in the judgment of the Study Team, too high.

During the Study Period, there were 10 new cars being equipped for duty. The City is to be complimented on recent initiatives to upgrade the police fleet. The recommendations include:

- A. Establish a replacement schedule for all marked police vehicles; a suggested replacement for any marked unit to be used in pursuits or above the speed limit is 70,000 to 80,000;
- B. Consider SUVs in place of some marked police vehicles and for the SIU;
- C. Reduce the police fleet once an established replacement schedule is implemented; and,
- D. Consider leasing police vehicles used in Special Investigations Unit, or in any undercover assignment.

Detective Division

The Detective Division was listed as being staffed with 33 personnel in August 2003. The staffing numbers vary by source. A "Division Personnel Allocation" table provided to the Study Team at the outset of the Study noted 43 sworn personnel assigned to the Detective Division. On November 19, 2003, police staff reported that there are 42 sworn members in the Detective Division: one Captain, one Lieutenant, six Sergeants, and 34 Detectives.

With 42 sworn members, the Cranston Police Department has approximately 28 percent of the sworn members in criminal investigations (42 of 149). This includes the Bureau of Criminal Identification (BCI), which is often staffed with trained non-sworn personnel in other police agencies and in the FBI. In the Study Team's experiences, the average percentage of sworn personnel assigned to criminal investigations in local police departments is approximately 15 percent.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

The Cranston Police Department does not utilize as a basic performance indicator Clearance Rates for the investigation of Index Crime. Typically, the Study Team recommends one general investigations detective for each 450 Index Crimes, recognizing that detectives also work other crimes, such as Part II Crimes. This benchmark was developed by the Study Team in working with more than 100 police agencies and by a former FBI official who works with Carroll Buracker & Associates, Inc. With 2,632 Index Crimes in 2002, the Department would need six Police Officers assigned to conduct general investigations. This would exclude personnel for juvenile crimes, BCI, and SIU. Of course, this benchmark is just a guide; moreover, the Study Team is not suggesting this staffing level in Cranston.

Neither the Cranston City Code nor the Contract Agreement between the City of Cranston, Rhode Island and International Brotherhood of Police officers Local Number 301 specify any number of sworn members who should be assigned to the Detective Division or investigative duties. There are references to personnel assigned to a 5/2 shift in terms of an additional 18 days of compensatory leave. The City Code is very specific in reference to “one hundred fifteen (115) police officers.”

The Study Team was impressed with the evening and weekend hours worked by Cranston Police Officers assigned to the Detective Division. **In this area, the Cranston Police Department is ahead of many police agencies in focusing on the needs of victims and the need to coordinate with patrol officers.** The recommendations include:

- A. Consider reassigning up to 10 police officers, who are assigned to the Detective Division, to the patrol function to enhance patrol services in the City of Cranston until and at such time as specific performance measurements are established for detective division functions; and,
- B. Utilize Clearance Rates as a Performance Indicator for future decisions on staffing of the Detective Division.

Evidence and Property

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

The evidence and property room is run by the Bureau of Criminal Investigation (BCI), which is responsible to the captain in charge of detectives.

There is no current policy and procedures manual for the handling of evidence and property. This has the potential for enormous liability exposure for the City of Cranston. The BCI staffing consists of one sergeant, two officers, and two civilian clerks. During the Study Period, one of the officers' positions was vacant.

There is no separate storage area or vault for drugs. Drugs are placed in tamper-proof evidence bags and placed on the storage shelves with other materials. The drugs can be weighed at the Health Department, but, reportedly, are not routinely weighed after they have been stored. All drugs are sent to the State lab for analysis.

Reportedly, the BCI sergeant in charge of the evidence and property room has never been provided with any training on the management of evidence and property control. Further, it was noted that the current staff have not conducted any audits of the property and evidence room. An official stated that he could not remember when an audit had ever been conducted. The recommendations include:

- A. Consider the installation of a card access system to the evidence and property room;
- B. Consider the use of video surveillance in the evidence and property room;
- C. Consider providing extra security for handling items considered to be sensitive, high in value, or otherwise constituting an increased security risk;
- D. Implement bar-coding to store and track evidence and property;
- E. Develop a comprehensive policy and procedures manual for the handling of evidence and property;
- F. Provide evidence and property management training to the BCI staff;
- G. Provide better key control and video surveillance for the off-hours evidence and property room;
- H. Consider the use of individual containers for off-hours evidence and property, especially if a new facility is provided in the future; and,
- I. Consider implementing audit procedures for property/evidence in compliance with accreditation (CALEA) standards.

Police Policies and Procedures Manual

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

One of the biggest complaints of members of the Cranston Police Department is the lack of an up-to-date police policy manual. A review of the document provided to the Study Team indicates major deficiencies: 1) the policies have the names/signatures of eight (8) police chiefs; 2) the dates on the policies range from 1975 to 2003; 3) there is no Table of Contents, or Index; 4) the latest ‘acknowledgment’ receipt has the name of Colonel Walter R. Craddock, Chief of Police, and Mayor John O’Leary.

A major concern for City administration is that new officers have no up-to-date policy manual to serve as a guide. Supervisors stated that discipline is difficult since there is a serious void in direction.

In the judgment of the Study Team, the **City of Cranston has the potential for substantial liability exposure without a current and state-of-the-art Police Policy Manual.** In developing a new police policy manual, any police agency has two primary choices: assign personnel in the police agency to complete the policy manual, or contract for an agency/person to assist the police department to develop the manual. As the manual is developed, the policies, procedures, general orders, special orders, and rules of conduct should be connected to accreditation standards by the Commission on Accreditation of Law Enforcement Agencies (CALEA).

Based on the Study Team’s observations, substantial work will be required to accredit the Cranston Police Department. In the experiences of the Study Team, it is not unusual for two to three internal personnel to take from two to three years to prepare a police department for accreditation by CALEA.. The time is often driven by the availability of an up-to-date police policy manual, training on the manual contents, and the need to show compliance with standards. In the State of Rhode Island, the State Police, City of Warwick, Cumberland Police Department and Smithfield Police Department are listed as accredited, certified, or recognized by CALEA. The recommendations:

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

- J. Develop a state-of-the-art Cranston Police Department Policy Manual as soon as possible (ASAP);
- K. Assure that all members are trained on the contents of the new Police Policy and Procedures Manual, including Rules of Conduct and all policies and procedures; and,
- L. Gain accreditation of the Cranston Police Department within three years.

Police Facilities

Although the Scope of Services for this Study did not include an assessment of police facilities, members of the Police Department (staff, supervisors and officers) noted major complaints about the conditions of the current police headquarters building. The Study Team was told by City officials and members of the Department that a \$13.1 million bond was approved by the voters for a new police headquarters. The City commissioned a “Space Needs Assessment” relative to a new police headquarters.

In the judgment of the Study Team, the Cranston Police Department Headquarters building is in very poor condition and should be upgraded as soon as possible. This Report contains an outline of some observations of the Study Team relative to the conditions. The recommendation:

- A. The City of Cranston is encouraged to take action as quickly as possible to provide new or renovated police facilities, and assure security measures are in place for the facility.

Police Records Function

The Cranston Police Department has 11 full-time employees and 8 part-time employees assigned to police records. The Report Review sergeant is the only sworn member of police records. All of the other positions are non-sworn personnel. The Department and City are to be complimented for having skilled non-sworn personnel in this administrative function.

The Chief Clerk of Staff Services position was reportedly created to assist in supervising some of the functions contained in Research and Planning and Police Records. The Study Team was told that the position may not be the most advantageous for the Department.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

The current police records management system utilized by the Department is based on the IMC computer system by the Information Management Corporation. The new IMC system is a recent innovation. It integrates Dispatch and Records and has the capability of an electronic records system.

According to staff, the records system appears to function reasonably well. The weakness in transcription systems relates to the delay in many reports getting past the typing stage, caused by the backlog in transcribing them. This problem has been overcome for some reports by designating them as high priority.

Reports can be entered into the system by the officer either entering the report directly or dictating it. There are not many computers available to officers; those that are available are not located in a convenient place for use. It is probable that more reports would be entered by officers if computers were more convenient. This is especially true if laptop computers were installed in the cruisers.

The police records function in Cranston is atypical in structure and reporting procedures. In the judgment of the Study Team, first-line supervisors should be charged with the review and approval of reports of their officers. This would allow them to more closely supervise their officers, take more immediate corrective action if investigations and reports are not properly done, and have more knowledge of their officers' capabilities and work performance for performance reviews.

Department officials said they had not been properly destroying records, but have been working on correcting the problem; moreover, there have been reported problems with the National Crime Information Center (NCIC) audits. Continued problems in this area could have serious consequences; the Department has recognized this and temporarily assigned a person from dispatch to validate records.

The Study Team was very impressed that the Cranston Records function is open in the evening hours for the convenience to the public to allow them to access records after working hours. **This practice is very positive. In this area, the Cranston Police Department is far ahead of other police agencies.** The records recommendations include:

- A. Develop policies and procedures and assure compliance with CALEA requirements relative to police records;

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

- B. Develop a flow chart portraying the flow of paperwork within the agency and to outside entities;
- C. Develop an organization chart depicting the organization of the Research and Planning Division and Records;
- D. Evaluate the Report Review Sergeant position and modify it to provide supervisory assistance to the Research and Planning Captain position;
- E. Assign first-line supervisors responsibly for reviewing and approving all reports from their officers;
- F. Evaluate the Chief Clerk of Staff Services position to ensure whether that position is good for the department in the future;
- G. Consider additional security measures for Headquarters when planning for another facility;
- H. Accelerate actions relative to records retention/destruction; and,
- I. Continue with plans to install laptop computers in the cruisers with the intent that officers could better enter their reports and access databases.

Research and Planning

Research and Planning contains most of the administrative functions of the Department, including police records, with the major exceptions of Dispatch and Payroll. Research and Planning is commanded by a captain who has a number other duties that require significant amounts of time. There is no secretary or other dedicated clerical staff assigned to the captain; the lack of clerical support is viewed as a major shortcoming. The duties and responsibilities of Research and Planning appear to have evolved without sufficient attention to organization and staffing. The function is understaffed and personnel are overworked. The recommendations include:

- A. Establish one Major Position and Establish one Captain Position;
- B. Establish Research and Planning as a separate function, reporting to the chief of Police or a Major of Technical and Administrative Services Bureau;
- C. Transfer Staff and Services Division Director position to Research and Planning Section;
- D. Add one Planner/Crime Analyst Position to Research and Planning; and,
- E. Transfer Report Review Sergeant Position to Special Assistant to Major of Technical and Administrative Services Bureau.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

Communications and Dispatch - Police

Officials in Cranston pointed out to the Study Team that things in Rhode Island are different than in other states. This is certainly the case in the processing of 911 calls.

The Study Team was advised by Cranston police and fire dispatch officials that all 911 calls for emergency service in Rhode Island are answered by one Public Safety Answering Point (PSAP) operated by the State of Rhode Island. Rhode Island includes approximately 1,214 square miles.

Reportedly, this statewide PSAP function is performed by the E911 Uniform Emergency Telephone System Division, which is headed by an executive director. An E911 Uniform Emergency Telephone System Board makes recommendations to the executive director.

Calls answered by the call takers of this state PSAP are forwarded to the appropriate municipal or other public safety agency. Once the 911 call is answered by the municipal dispatch center, each of these agencies then takes action to dispatch or otherwise handle the call.

The Study Team was advised that emergency 911 calls received by the state PSAP are forwarded to Rhode Island municipalities via ten-digit telephone numbers. **Erroneous ten-digit calls (e.g. wrong numbers) and calls from telemarketers come in on the telephone lines assigned for emergencies** taking valuable dispatcher time and potentially interfering with incoming emergency calls from the State PSAP.

Cranston Police Department Dispatch

The Cranston Police Department dispatch is located organizationally in the Staff and Services Division. Reportedly, due to the unfortunate extended absence of the head of this

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

division for medical reasons, the evening patrol captain supervises dispatch at night, and Radio Communications staff report to the Planning and Research captain on day work.

There apparently is no supervisory position at the dispatcher working level to provide shift supervision for dispatch operations on a daily basis. All of the dispatch staff are similarly classified. The result is that when two or three dispatchers are on-duty in Radio Communications, there is no one individual officially in charge. This is a significant breach of an essential supervisory chain of command in a very important functional area of police service delivery.

Police Radio Communications is staffed by 17 civilian police dispatchers. Reportedly, these dispatchers are assigned to one of three shifts to staff Radio Communications 24 hours per day, seven days per week.

The Cranston Police Department utilizes a number of simplex UHF radio frequencies for their operations. Apparently, there is limited interoperability between police and fire radio systems at this time.

Cranston police officials advised that a \$390,000 grant application has been prepared and submitted via state agencies to obtain Federal Homeland Security funding for a major upgrade to the current radio system that should improve interoperability between police, fire/EMS, and other regional radio systems to improve communications during major, multi-agency disaster operations. The Police Department dispatch process is supported by a CAD system designed and implemented by Information Management Corporation (IMC) located in Grafton, Massachusetts. The CAD system is Dispatch and Police Records version 4.4, which tracks all police dispatch calls. There is no 911-CAD interface since the state does not forward 911 calls via 911 trunk lines. The recommendations include:

- J. Consolidate Police Department and Fire Department Communications and Dispatch into a Cranston Emergency Communications Center (CECC);
- K. Incorporate Fire Department's (current sworn) dispatchers, after civilianization, into the Police Department and assign Chief of Police responsibility for CECC;

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

- L. Consider the suggested dispatch facility design criteria with building renovations or new Police Department Building;
- M. Appoint an experienced dispatch director to manage the CECC;
- N. Assign the appointed director to develop a transition plan;
- O. Establish a CECC dispatcher position career ladder;
- P. Establish one labor union as the bargaining unit for CECC civilian employees;
- Q. Establish a Communications Steering Committee;
- R. If no consolidation occurs, take the following actions:
 - 1) Upgrade supervision in the Police Department communications;
 - 2) Work with the State of Rhode Island to update the 911 system, to include 911 trunk lines to the Cranston dispatch center(s) to eliminate use of 10-digit forwarding of emergency 911 callers from the State 911 PSAP to Cranston;
 - 3) Appoint a Police Department Civilian Dispatch Supervisor; and,
 - 4) Revise the dispatcher rank structure to provide a qualified on-duty floor shift supervisor in Police Department Communications.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

Human Resource Management (HRM) Recommendations Police

The sworn members of the Cranston Police Department are represented by the International Brotherhood of Police Officers (IBPO)/Local 301. The current Agreement is from FY2002-2005. All full-time police officers through the rank of Captain are governed by the Agreement. Only the Chief of Police and Major are excluded from the Agreement. In effect, the management team consists of two personnel. The management of the Police Department is outlined with great detail in the Agreement. For civilian police employees, there exists a Collective Bargaining Agreement between the City of Cranston and the Cranston City Workers' Union. This Agreement expired June 30, 2003, and there is a Tentative Agreement, which would be in effect through June 30, 2005, once ratified by the Cranston City Council. The Tentative Agreement contains changes regarding salary and wages (i.e., freezing of), vacation buyback, uniforms, layoffs/furloughs, healthcare and personal leave.

The Study Team was told that one sworn member of the Cranston Police Department works full-time for Cranston and full-time for another police department. The City is encouraged to determine the validity of this statement and, if true, establish regulations on outside or secondary employment. A number of the HRM recommendations, some of which may require negotiations with Local 301, include:

- A. Pursue actively the re-establishment of management rights through future interest arbitration proceedings and/or litigation;
- B. Remove all management personnel from current labor agreement;
- C. Eliminate most seniority provisions;
- D. Consider pursuing arbitration/litigation regarding seniority provisions as violating the concept of equal opportunity, and as being in conflict with Federal laws pertaining to racial/ethnic, gender, and age discrimination.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

- E. Initiate more aggressive, energetic, and targeted racial/ethnic and gender minority recruitment programs designed to attract greater quantities of quality applicants for sworn positions.
- F. Initiate more aggressive, energetic and targeted racial/ethnic and gender minority recruitment programs designed to attract greater quantities of quality applicants for civilian positions.
- G. Develop and implement written standard operating procedures (SOPs) for all recruitment and selection activities.
- H. Discontinue the six-week CPD Police Recruit Academy as part of the selection process, and direct the police resources to operational services as possible;
- I. Assure that all recruits participate in the FTO program after successful completion of the Municipal Police Training Academy.
- J. Discontinue the practice of allowing FTOs who have not fully been FTO-trained to train recruits.
- K. Conduct a risk/safety assessment/audit of the range facility.
- L. Discontinue the use of seniority as the basis for attendance at specialized training.
- M. Examine remedies designed to reduce the incidence of promotional examination grievances.
- N. Develop written policy pertaining to the conduct of I/A investigations.
- O. Develop a computerized Internal Affairs Investigation Record System.
- P. Develop and disseminate a brochure that describes and illustrates how citizen complaints are to be submitted, and the procedural circumstances surrounding their investigation. This brochure should be non-threatening in character, and citizen friendly.
- Q. Discontinue the practice of purging disciplinary actions after three years.
- R. Monitor personnel who repeatedly emerge in Workers' Compensation claims;
- S. Monitor sick leave usage more closely, and initiate remedial actions with those suspected of abuse.
- T. Capture information pertaining to the nature and number of on-the-job injuries sustained by personnel for the purpose of developing and implementing focused prevention initiatives;
- U. Develop and implement programs designed to reduce the incidence of on-the-job injuries (e.g., flyers/brochures, incentives, awareness campaigns);

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

- V. Initiate training in the areas of health/wellness, fitness, safety, and accident prevention;
- W. Develop standards pertaining to the amount and nature of permitted secondary employment;
- X. Develop standards pertaining to the amount of permitted details.

Future Police Department Organization

The Study Team suggests that the City and Police Department consider reorganizing the Cranston Police Department.

- Y. Abolish one Sergeant position and establish one additional Deputy Chief position at the rank of Major.
- Z. Assign one Deputy Chief to Operations: patrol, traffic, detective function;
- AA. Assign one Deputy Chief to all Administrative and Technical Services functions, including records, dispatch, planning/research, animal control, property and evidence, special details, payroll, purchasing.
- BB. Reduce Planning & Research to a Section, rather than a Division;
- CC. Continue with Captains in Internal Affairs, Detective Division, and Patrol.
- DD. Consider allocating 8 to 10 police officer positions in Detective Division to patrol services.
- EE. Add one planner/crime analyst civilian position, and assign to Planning & Research.
- FF. Incorporate the recommended nine civilianized positions in Fire Alarm into an integrated Cranston Emergency Communications Center.
- GG. Permit the Police Department to “dual encumber” up to 8 sworn police positions when vacancies are known in advance, or to fill positions on extended sick leave; this would increase staffing to 157 when 149 trained are not available; additions should be based on transfer of some officers from Detective Division to Patrol Division.

Police Fiscal Impacts

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

The fiscal impacts will depend on which recommendations the City of Cranston decides to or has the funding to implement. In addition to upgrading the infrastructure of the Cranston Police Department, e.g., policy manual and manuals on other critical support functions, a top priority is a new police Headquarters Building. Of course, the Chief of Police should have major input into any decisions relative to the future staffing, organization, operations, written directives system, technical services, and facilities for the Police Department. The recommendations with fiscal impacts relative to significant changes include:

- A. Abolish one Sergeant position and establish one Major position;
- B. Transfer Staff and Services Director position to Research and Planning: minimal fiscal impact;
- C. Transfer 8-10 Police Officers from Detective Division to the Patrol Division; this suggestion reflects a policy change rather than major fiscal outlays; however, some equipment/vehicles funds may be needed;
- D. Add one Civilian position for Planner/Crime Analyst;
- E. Add one Civilian clerical position for Police Major/Research & Planning;
- F. Add eight (8) Police Officer positions for Patrol Division (dual encumbered to avoid major patrol staffing shortages caused by attrition); suggest this action be coupled with transfer of 8-10 Police Officer positions from the Detective Division to Patrol; a portion of these costs should be offset through a reduction in overtime; and,
- G. Update the Fleet through phasing out vehicles over 80,000 miles.

Review of the Police Department Observations and Findings

The Mayor is encouraged to take 60 days to review the observations and findings in this Strategic Plan. During that period, he is encouraged to gain relevant input from the Chief of Police relative to any observations, findings, or suggestions. The input from the Chief of Police should be given substantial weight. Moreover, relevant input from the International Brotherhood of Police Officers (IBPO)/Local 301 is also encouraged.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

POLICE DEPARTMENT (continued)

In an agency that does not have a detailed, up-to-date police policy manual, or manuals on major functions, the verbal expressions by employees about practices and programs may not be the same as the understanding of officials; therefore, the 60-day period should be utilized to provide clarification and/or amplification to any of the information in this report.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

FIRE DEPARTMENT

Personnel Profile

The Cranston Fire Department has 203 Uniformed/Sworn personnel. The actual authorized is 202. The additional position seems to be a result of one employee on extended absence. A review of the ethnicity and gender of these employees indicate:

- A. All 203 Uniformed/Sworn members of the Cranston Fire Department are White Males;
- B. Minorities are under-represented in the sworn workforce; and,
- C. Females are under-represented in the sworn workforce.

In conducting reviews of fire departments, the Study Team has not seen a paid fire department without uniformed/sworn women or minorities in 20 years. In this regard, Cranston is, indeed, unique. It is important to note that the City's non-white population is increasing. Between 1990 and 2000, an increase of six percent occurred in the City's non-white population (i.e., 5 to 11 percent).

Under Human Resources Management, the Study Team has suggested initiatives to improve women and minority representation in the Cranston Fire Department.

Mission Statement

Reportedly, there is no "Mission Statement" for the Cranston Fire Department (CFD). Over the next five years, the Cranston Fire Department will spend more than \$100 million. The reasons why there is no mission statement are unclear. The recommendation:

- A. Establish a Mission Statement, establish Service Level Objectives to meet the Mission Statement, and incorporate Values within a policy manual.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Fire Budget

The Fire Department's adopted budget in 1998 was listed by the City as \$18,039,538 in 1998. The FY2003 Total Budget for the Cranston Fire Department is listed in City publications as \$24,695,797, a \$6,656,259 increase since 1998, or a 36.89 percent increase. The Fire Department's budget, as published by the State of Rhode Island, was \$24,756,797 in FY2003.

Comparative Per Capita Fire Costs

The State of Rhode Island publishes the police and fire budgets for cities and towns within the state. However, there is no consistency in reporting the data. For example, Cranston submits the total budget, while most other cities separate pension and hospitalization costs for police and fire services. Reporting of dental costs are not consistent. In light of inconsistencies in the published data in Rhode Island, relative per capita costs are not included herein. For the reader interested in those data, the likely approach is to contact officials in each city to be sure the data are consistent.

The ICMA publishes data relative to average fire per capita costs for cities in specific population ranges. The per capita costs listed in the ICMA Municipal Year Book, 2003 for 2002 per capita costs are as follows:

126 cities with a population range of 50,000 to 100,000:	\$118.45
60 cities with a population range of 100,000 to 250,000:	\$125.53
17 cities with a population range of 250,000 to 500,000:	\$119.94
7 cities with a population range of 500,000 to 1 million:	\$127.42

The City of Cranston Data for FY2002:

Cranston-Rhode Island Web site (80,072 ÷ \$21,134,085) **\$263.94**

Caution is required in the interpretation of the data. The ICMA notes that its average per capita costs include retirement and medical costs.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

FIRE DEPARTMENT (continued)

Comparative Fire Department Staffing

Although the Study Team did not locate Fire Department staffing information by city in Rhode Island, officials may want to obtain this comparative data by contacting each of the cities. (As noted previously, the FBI publishes national data on police staffing.) The ICMA publishes fire staffing data by population range and number of cities reporting in each population range. The per capita staffing listed in the ICMA Municipal Year Book, 2003 for **2002 staffing** is as follows

<u>City Classification</u>	<u>Total</u>	<u>Uniformed/Sworn</u>
73/69 cities in New England	1.70	1.67
7 cities with a population range of 500,000 to 1 million:	1.93	1.69
17 cities with a population range of 250,000 to 500,000:	1.42	1.42
81/79 cities with a population range of 100,000 to 250,000:	1.57	1.41
152/148 cities with a population range of 50,000 to 100,000:	1.52	1.35
The data for Cranston:		
Cranston Authorized (202 Uniformed, 208 Total - 80,072):	<u>2.59</u>	<u>2.52</u>
City of Cranston - 2003 Estimated Population 81,674:	2.54	2.47

The Cranston Fire Department staffing ratios of Uniformed/Sworn and 'Total' employees per 1,000 residents is substantially above seven cities that serve a population of 500,000 to one million residents and that reported fire staffing data to the ICMA. If the Cranston Fire Department equaled the staffing ratio of seven cities that reported to the ICMA a population of 500,000 to one million residents, the Cranston Fire Department would need 139 Uniformed/Sworn Personnel (1.69 x 81.674 thousand residents-2003 estimate), or **63 fewer Uniformed/Sworn** personnel than 2003. If the Department equaled the fire staffing ratio of Uniformed/Sworn per 1,000 residents for the average of 148 cities with a population of 50,000 to 100,000 (1.35 x 81.674 -2003 estimate), Cranston would need 111 Uniformed/Sworn personnel, substantially fewer than the current 202.

In the Study Team's experiences in 40 states, it is most unusual for a fire department to have a higher ratio or number of sworn personnel per 1,000 population than police departments in those

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

FIRE DEPARTMENT (continued)

same cities. In Cranston, the Fire Department has 53 more uniformed/sworn positions than the Cranston Police Department.

Caution is required in the interpretation of the data; moreover, public safety personnel in Cranston point out that practices in Rhode Island are different.

Fire Grants

The Study Team was impressed with the number and magnitude of the grants that have been obtained in recent years from various sources for the Cranston Fire Department. These grants were primarily from the Federal Department of Homeland Security via the Rhode Island Emergency Management Agency. Reportedly, the grants that have recently been obtained include:

- A. Heavy rescue unit - \$200,000
- B. Utility pickup truck for special services support - \$37,000
- C. Hazardous material equipment - \$75,000
- D. Ear protection - \$21,700
- E. Communications for investigators - \$1,500
- F. Training mannequin - \$1,000
- G. Laptop computer to support operations - \$3,000

Perceptions of Fire Department Employees

The Study Team always interviews employees and officials in labor groups in police departments and fire departments during Comprehensive studies. The interview perceptions on the Cranston Police Department were noted previously.

For the Fire Department, the City of Cranston arranged a meeting between members of the International Association of Firefighters (IAFF)/Local 1363 and the Study Team. The IAFF officials came to City Hall for the meeting. After entering the Conference Room and after the Study Team gave a brief introduction, the IAFF members left the room. There were no further interviews with these union officials. Only the Fire Chief and a number of the deputy chiefs agreed to meet with the Study Team. Their perceptions of strengths are listed in Chapter Six.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

FIRE DEPARTMENT (continued)

Fire Operations

According to CFD records, the Fire Department handled 13,041 fire, rescue and EMS-related incidents in 2002. Reportedly, 72 percent of those incidents (9,478 calls) were EMS-related.

There are a number of accepted models for the delivery of pre-hospital EMS in the United States. The Cranston approach involves the Fire Department providing all pre-hospital Basic Life Support (BLS) and Advanced Life Support (ALS) EMS service in the City with four rescue (ambulance) transport units and fire apparatus responding as EMS first responder units.

In the delivery of EMS, the Cranston Fire Department staff utilize automatic defibrillators for the treatment of serious heart attack victims. This is a very progressive EMS service delivery tool, which is a state-of-the-art approach to saving lives across the U.S.

The CFD apparently has the policy of dispatching at least a rescue and an engine on all types of EMS calls. This seems to be “excessive” unit response, since, nationally, most basic EMS calls are handled by a single rescue/ambulance, unless there is a need for an additional unit due to the nature of the call, need for additional staffing and/or the rescue unit is coming from a significant distance.

The fire prevention function of the Fire Department is headed by a deputy chief who manages a broad range of related programs and activities including inspections, issuance of certifications of compliance and special permits, complaint and fire investigations, public education demonstrations, and the juvenile fire setters programs.

The Insurance Services Office conducted a classification assessment in early 2003. It took into account the Fire Department, the apparatus, maintenance, fire prevention, codes enforcement, communications, and water supply. It was noted that there are a number of areas, particularly in the Fire Department, where improvements could lead to an upgrade in the ISO rating for Cranston. The fire operations recommendations include:

- A. Ensure that workload data is maintained, reviewed, and assessed regularly in support of service-related decisions;

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

FIRE DEPARTMENT (continued)

- B. Implement a means of automatically documenting actual Fire Department response times;
- C. Revise the unit dispatch policy for EMS calls that provides for the dispatch of one rescue unit on most basic EMS calls with additional unit/s based on justified need;
- D. Develop and implement a stricter policy and procedure relating to the fee collection process for EMS calls;
- E. Continue aggressively working to significantly reduce the excessive Cranston mutual aid rescue responses to Providence;
- F. Implement a comprehensive pre-fire planning program where the firefighting personnel visit the target hazards in the City, tour each facility, prepare drawings and lists of hazards, and then, upon return to the station, develop the tactics and strategy for handling incidents at the particular facility;
- G. Incorporate the review and familiarization of completed pre-fire plans and related facilities into the Fire Department's training program;
- H. Assign on-duty firefighters to perform the actual official fire inspections in order to more fully support the functions of the fire prevention captain;
- I. Establish a Life and Fire Safety Education Committee to develop and implement a fire safety education program in Cranston; and,
- J. Establish and implement a plan to improve the Cranston ISO rating.

Training and Safety

The Cranston Fire Department is lacking a comprehensive Safety Program that complies with Federal regulations, Rhode Island law, and widely accepted NFPA standards pertaining to safety. In addition, there is no wellness and fitness program to help ensure individual peak readiness for emergency response.

The Study Team recommends that current personnel be assigned health and wellness responsibilities. This is necessary if the Department is to take care of its most valuable resource - its employees. The recommendations include:

- A. Maintain the current two positions needed to adequately staff the Training Division, and ensure that vacancies within the division are filled rapidly;

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

FIRE DEPARTMENT (continued)

- B. Develop and implement a probation (rookie) training program. This should include specifics for a preceptor component to ensure consistency and quality in the program;
- C. Develop, implement, and maintain a state-of-the-art in-service training program utilizing a train-the-trainer approach to delivery and all of the criteria for credits identified in the ISO rating system;
- D. Develop and implement an officer development program. The program should support participation in college programs as well as State and National Fire Academy courses, especially the EFO program;
- E. Place a high priority on fire training certification programs with emphasis on a goal of having all CFD staff certified at the Firefighter II level, at a minimum;
- F. Implement a comprehensive computer-based records management system to include a training database component;
- G. Develop a comprehensive Safety Program in compliance with OSHA regulations and in accordance to NFPA Standard 1500;
- H. Review and revise the Infection Control Plan periodically;
- I. Review and update the rehabilitation program to fully meet standards and requirements;
- J. Support the development and implementation of a wellness and fitness program based on the program developed by the IAFF and IAFC.

Fire Apparatus

In the judgment of the Study Team, the Cranston Fire Department could make a number of adjustments in the pumper, ladder truck, and rescue apparatus fleet to reduce costs while at the same time continuing to meet nationally recognized standards and criteria.

The Study Team encourages the City and the Fire Department to consider its future apparatus needs carefully. These units are quite high in cost, as well as requiring a significant commitment of personnel time and effort to maintain. Another consideration in such decisions relates to the relative availability of personnel to staff the units. With insufficient staffing, there is little justification for retaining redundant apparatus.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

FIRE DEPARTMENT (continued)

Viewed generally, the apparatus in Cranston is in relatively good, though aging, condition. The cost and effort required to maintain an aging fleet are significantly more than that required for a fewer number of modern pieces of apparatus. Officials are encouraged to continue to retain two qualified mechanics to provide quality maintenance and utilize the suggested apparatus replacement criteria. The recommendations include:

- A. Continue the current approach to the maintenance of fire/rescue apparatus—work performed primarily at Station 2 by two qualified fire apparatus mechanics (civilian);
- B. Conduct an in-depth unit by unit reassessment of all cars, vans, and pickup trucks to determine justification for continued inclusion in the CFD fleet;
- C. Implementing the proposed reduction in the apparatus fleet, including removing one aging aerial truck and one rescue unit from the fleet;
 - 1. Reduce Engines from 8 to 5;
 - 2. Reduce Ladder Trucks from 5 to 4;
 - 3. Reduce Rescue Units from 6 to 5;
- D. Adopt the suggested apparatus replacement criteria; and,
- E. Conduct a thorough inventory of the hand tools and equipment on all fire apparatus and upgrade any engine or ladder (including reserve units) equipment inventory to meet ISO criteria.

Fire and EMS Dispatch

Emergency dispatching of Cranston fire and rescue resources is handled by the Fire Alarm Division of the Cranston Fire Department. According to the Rules and Regulations of the CFD, the Division is responsible for “the care and maintenance of the signal and telephone service of the Department and its members shall comprise a Superintendent, Operator Supervisors, Operators, lead lineman and lineman.”

The superintendent, whose rank in the CFD is deputy chief, heads the division, is responsible to the chief, and has “general supervision of the Division and its members and to make such rules regulating the Division, which are not inconsistent with the Rules and Regulations of the Department or those made by the Chief, with the approval of the Mayor.”

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

FIRE DEPARTMENT (continued)

The contractual and budgeted staffing of the CFD fire dispatch function includes the following: one Superintendent (deputy chief), four Lieutenant/Fire Alarm positions, and four Firefighter positions. The minimum staffing of the CFD fire dispatch center is two personnel on duty at all times, one of which must be either a fire alarm lieutenant or a firefighter/fire alarm operator.

The officers and firefighters assigned to work in the CFD dispatch center work the same schedule as the field fire station-assigned staff—an average work week of forty-two hours; the work schedule consists of two (2) consecutive days of ten (10) hours each, two (2) consecutive days of fourteen hour nights, followed by four (4) days off.

Cranston Fire Department officials indicated to the Study Team that their fire and EMS dispatch process is not supported by a CAD system. There appears to be a recognition of the need to implement a fire/EMS CAD system; however, at this time, the fire and EMS dispatch process is entirely manual.

The Study Team was advised that the CFD utilizes a combination of VHF and UHF simplex frequencies for their dispatch and operations. The Department utilizes one tower site located at headquarters/Fire Station #2 for its transmitter and five other sites throughout the City as voting receiver sites. The recommendations include:

- A. Consolidate Police Department and Fire Department communications and dispatch under the Police Department;
- B. Implement Emergency Medical Dispatch service and related quality assurance services provided by the dispatchers serving Cranston as an enhancement to EMS service provision;
- C. If no consolidation, take the following actions:
 - 1) Update the written duties and responsibilities of the Fire Alarm Division;
 - 2) Civilianize the Fire Alarm functions;
 - 3) Implement a state-of-the-art CAD system in Fire Alarm;

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

FIRE DEPARTMENT (continued)

- 4) Ensure that the dispatch staffs serving Cranston are provided with a comprehensive training program that meets or exceeds state and national standards, principles, and practices.
- D. Ensure that all relevant emergency caller information is recorded by the Fire Alarm dispatch staff, including the identity of the caller.

Human Resources Management Fire Department

As previously mentioned, the members of the Cranston Fire Department are represented by the International Association of Fire Fighters (IAFF)/Local 1363. The Agreement is for the period July 1, 2001 to June 30, 2004. A number of the recommendations for HRM, some of which may require negotiations with Local 1363, are outlined as follows:

- A. Pursue actively the re-establishment of management rights through future interest arbitration proceedings and/or litigation;
- B. Remove all management personnel from current labor agreement;
- C. Eliminate most seniority provisions;
- D. Include EMT/C certification as a post-hiring, pre-completion of probationary period requirement;
- E. Implement an EMT/C loan or grant program, if 'D' above is not possible;
- F. Cease the 50 percent weighting of the written examination;
- G. Cease the 50 percent weighting of the physical ability/agility test. Consider pursuing arbitration/litigation regarding seniority provisions as violating the concept of equal opportunity, and as being in conflict with Federal laws pertaining to racial/ethnic, gender and age discrimination;
- H. Initiate more aggressive, energetic, and targeted racial/ethnic and gender minority recruitment programs designed to attract greater quantities of quality applicants for sworn and civilian positions;
- I. Develop and implement written standard operating procedures (SOPs) for all recruitment and selection activities;

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

FIRE DEPARTMENT (continued)

- J. Maintain a log of all grievances to include: the nature of the grievance, the rank and position of the employee filing it, the step at which the grievance was settled, and the nature of the settlement;
- K. Maintain a log of all internal and citizen complaints pertaining to alleged misconduct of employees to include: the nature of the complaint, whether the complaint was generated internally or by a citizen, whether the complaint involved a uniformed or civilian employee, the outcome of the investigation, and the discipline applied, if any;
- L. Maintain a log of all disciplinary actions to include: the rank and position of the employee involved, the nature of the misconduct, the nature of the discipline applied, and whether the discipline was grieved and with what result;
- M. Implement a psychological assessment component;
- N. Monitor personnel who repeatedly emerge in Workers' Compensation claims;
- O. Capture information pertaining to the nature and number of on-the-job injuries sustained by personnel for the purpose of developing and implementing focused prevention initiatives;
- P. Develop and implement programs designed to reduce the incidence of on-the-job injuries (e.g., flyers/brochures, incentives, awareness campaigns);
- Q. Initiate training in the areas of health/wellness, fitness, safety, and accident prevention; and,
- R. Develop standards pertaining to the amount and nature of permitted secondary employment.

Fire Stations

The Cranston Fire Department has six fire stations. Station #2 houses the Fire Chief, senior staff, administrative functions, Fire Prevention Division, Training Division, EMS Division, HazMat Division, and the on-duty shift command officer. Further, the Fire Alarm Division, which handles all emergency 911 call taking and dispatch, and the Maintenance Division, which provides all fire and EMS apparatus and equipment maintenance, are located at Station #2.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

FIRE DEPARTMENT (continued)

The Study Team utilized a computer model of the City of Cranston for purposes of conducting a fire station location analysis. Fire Stations 1 and 2 are approximately .5 and .6 miles, respectively, from the borders with Providence and Warwick. The proximity to the city border means that these two fire stations, where currently located, will never have full service areas within Cranston as compared to the other fire stations. These fire stations have “half/partial pie-shaped” response areas which do not allow them to operate as efficiently as the other fire stations in terms of service for the dollars spent.

Moreover, Fire Stations 1, 2, and 3 are very close together, .9 miles between Fire Stations 1 and 2 and .8 miles between Fire Stations 2 and 3, via the closest response routes. When considering the 1.5 mile ISO coverage standard for engine companies, these fire stations are significantly closer geographically than necessary.

Fire Stations 4 and 5 are approximately .75 and .7 miles, respectively, from the border with Warwick. This proximity to the City border means that these two fire stations, where currently located, also will never have full response areas within Cranston as compared to the other fire stations. These fire stations also have “half/partial-pie shaped” response areas which does not allow them to operate as efficiently as the other fire stations in terms of service for the dollars spent. Moreover, the proximity of Fire Stations 4 and 5 to each other is 1.3 miles, and indicates that there may be up to 1.5 miles of over-coverage between the engine companies located at these two fire stations. Therefore, the proximity of these two fire stations and their proximity to each other illustrates that there could be a more cost effective approach to fire services provision in this area of the City.

In the opinion of the Study Team, consideration should be given to replacing Fire Station 4 with a new fire station centrally located to the geographic areas currently served by Fire Stations 4 and 5, and closing current Fire Station #5 and Engine 5. A new, relocated Fire Station #4, could be built, for example, in the general vicinity of Oaklawn Avenue and Route 37. The specific location would need to be determined by Cranston officials based on available property for a new fire station, and roadway accesses for optimum emergency response.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

FIRE DEPARTMENT (continued)

The ISO standard for ladder company response areas is that “the built-upon area of the city should have a first-due ladder-service company within 2.5 miles.” A review of the current locations indicate that the CFD ladder company locations far exceed the ISO standard with significant response area overlap.

It appears to the Study Team that the City of Cranston could reasonably consider implementing a properly staffed quint ladder truck at Fire Station 1, in place of the dedicated engine and ladder companies currently assigned to that fire station. The geographic area covered by current Engine 1 and Ladder 1 responding from Fire Station 1 is limited due to the narrow area of Edgewood where this CFD fire station is located.

Fire Department Organization

The Department has an authorized strength of 202 uniformed firefighting and 6 civilian support personnel. The chain of command in the Department includes one fire chief, one assistant fire chief, five deputy chiefs who head divisions, and four groups (shifts) each with a deputy chief and a complement of captains, lieutenants, and firefighters assigned to the six fire stations.

The Suppression Division is headed by four shift deputy chiefs and includes the field firefighting and rescue forces.

A deputy chief heads each of five divisions: fire prevention, HazMat, training, EMS, and fire alarm.

The organizational structure of the Cranston Fire Department seems to be top heavy in terms of the number of senior staff, and the tasks performed by a number of the senior staff members appear to be inappropriate to their rank. Some tasks performed by senior fire officers could be assigned more appropriately to junior officers, thereby allowing senior

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

FIRE DEPARTMENT (continued)

officers more time to perform administrative duties more appropriate to their rank. Of course, there are major costs for these extra high-ranking personnel. The recommendations include:

- A. Abolish one Assistant Fire Chief position and establish one Captain position for EMS;
- B. Abolish one Deputy Chief position and establish one Captain position for HazMat;
- C. Abolish four Deputy Chief positions and establish four Battalion Chief positions;
- D. Reassign the Superintendent of Fire Alarm position to serve as the Director of a newly created police, fire and EMS dispatch center and operation;
- E. Abolish a Captain, three Lieutenant positions and reallocating 20 Firefighters to staff Quint 1 with an Officer and four Firefighters;
- F. Abolish a Captain, three Lieutenant and 16 Firefighter positions with the phase out of Engine 2;
- G. Abolish One Captain, three Lieutenant and 16 Firefighter positions with the phase out of Engine 5; and,
- H. Abolish four Lieutenant and four Firefighter positions and establish eight civilian supervisor and dispatcher positions.

With 202 uniformed personnel, the recommendations relate to a reduction of 53 uniformed Fire Department personnel, 9 positions of which are recommended for civilianization of fire alarm. If the Fire Alarm Superintendent, a deputy chief position, and the 8 uniformed dispatchers are civilianized and transferred, the net reduction to the Cranston Fire Department is 53 positions; however, the proposed staffing over the next five years is a net reduction of 44 City-funded positions, since nine are proposed for transfer to the Police Department initially as dispatchers. Once a combined communications center is fully staffed and personnel trained, it is unlikely that all nine personnel would be needed for the future.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

FIRE DEPARTMENT (continued)

Fire Department Fiscal Impacts

The Fire Department-related fiscal impacts will depend on which, if any, recommendations are implemented by the City of Cranston. The primary areas related to cost avoidance include:

- J. The reduction in the apparatus fleet by three engines, one ladder truck and one rescue unit, estimated at \$2.6 million over the 20-year life cycle of the apparatus;
- K. A reduction in the engine apparatus fleet by an additional engine, if the quint (combination engine/ladder) is implemented at Fire Station #1, estimated at \$464,000 over the 20-year life cycle of the apparatus;
- L. Implementation of the revised organizational structure is estimated at a cost avoidance of \$60,000 per year or \$300,000 over a five-year period, not including fringe benefits or cost of living; this relates to abolishing the assistant chief position, abolishing one deputy chief position, establishing two captain positions, and abolishing four deputy chief positions and simultaneously establishing four battalion chief positions;
- M. A reduction in apparatus staffing by 44 positions (three captains, nine lieutenants, and 32 firefighters) from phasing out three engine companies, estimated at a cost avoidance of \$2.1 million annually, or \$10.5 million over five years, not including fringe benefits;
- N. A reduction in civilianizing the four lieutenant and four firefighter-operator positions as part of the implementation of a combined police, fire and EMS dispatch operations, estimated at a cost avoidance of \$123,000 annually, or \$615,000 over five years, excluding fringe benefits and cost of living. The civilianization of the Deputy Chief Position (Fire Alarm Superintendent) will not likely represent savings or cost avoidance;
- O. The cost of construction of a new, centrally-located, Fire Station 4 with an estimated one-time cost of \$1 million (plus cost of property) for an 8,000 square foot fire station and cost avoidance from the operation of five fire stations, estimated at \$375,000 over a five-year period; and,
- P. The cost of approximately 1,500 additional square feet of space and fire dispatch systems and subsystems added to the new police station (if the City chooses to have the CPD responsible for the new proposed CECC), estimated at a one-time cost of \$400,000.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

FIRE DEPARTMENT (continued)

Review of the Fire Department Audit, Observations, and Suggestions

The Mayor is encouraged to take 60 days to review the observations and findings in this Strategic Plan. During that period, he is encouraged to gain relevant input from the Fire Chief relative to any observations, findings, or suggestions. The input from the Fire Chief should be given substantial weight. Moreover, relevant input from the International Association of Fire Fighters (IAFF)/Local 1363 is also encouraged. The 60-day period should be utilized to provide clarification, amplification, or corrections to any of the information in this report.